

Iowa's S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit

Tax Credits Program Evaluation Study

December 2020

By Karen Tigges

Tax Research and Program Analysis Section Iowa Department of Revenue

Preface

During the 2005 Legislative Session the Iowa Department of Revenue received an appropriation to establish the Tax Credits Tracking and Analysis Program to track tax credit awards and claims. In addition, the Department was directed to perform periodic evaluations of tax credit programs. This is the second evaluation study completed for this administrative tax credit.

This study and other evaluations of Iowa tax credits can be found on the <u>Tax Credits</u> <u>Tracking and Analysis Program web page</u> on the Iowa Department of Revenue website.

Table of Contents

I. Introduction
II. S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit4
III. S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credits in Other States
IV. Analysis of S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims
V. Conclusion7
Tables and Figures
Table 1. How Corporation Income Is Taxed in Neighboring States 9
Table 2. S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims, Tax Years 2006 - 2019 10
Table 3. Corporations Filing 1120S Returns and Estimated Number of Shareholders, Tax Years 2012 – 2019
Figure 1. Adjusted Gross Income of All Households Compared to Households With S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims, Tax Years 2006 - 2018
Figure 2. Adjusted Gross Household Income of All Households with Schedule E Pass-Through Income Compared to Households With Schedule E Pass-Through
Income and S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims, Tax Years 2013 - 2018

I. Introduction

The S Corporation Apportionment (S Corp) Tax Credit went into effect for tax years beginning on or after January 1, 1996. A taxpayer is eligible to claim the S Corp Tax Credit when he or she is an Iowa resident who is also a shareholder of an S Corporation that conducts business both in Iowa and outside of the state. The tax credit is nonrefundable with no carry forward and cannot be transferred to another taxpayer. Originally, the tax credit could only be claimed against individual income tax. However, effective in tax year 2013 and subsequent tax years, the tax credit can also be claimed on a fiduciary return filed by estates and trusts.

Section II of this study provides information about the S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit. Section III provides information about how other states apportion pass-through income and Section IV looks at the statistics related to the S Corp Tax Credit. Section V concludes this study.

II. S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit

The S Corp Tax Credit is considered an administrative tax credit. As an administrative credit, the S Corp Tax Credit is not intended to change behavior or encourage economic activity like many other State tax credits. The tax credit gives S corporation owners' and shareholders the option to apportion income in a manner similar to that which is provided for C corporations. A C corporation is a business structure that creates a new, separate, legal entity distinct from its owners as provided in sub-chapter C of the Internal Revenue Code. A C corporation is a taxable entity where income from the activities of the business is taxed on the Iowa corporation income tax return, IA 1120 S corporations, by contrast, are formed to comply with sub-chapter S of the Internal Revenue Code. They provide, the same limited liability of a C corporation. However, all income from the activities of the business is passed-through to the shareholders and included on lowa individual income tax returns. S corporations, required to file the IA 1120S information return annually, are limited to fewer than 100 shareholders and all owners must be people; shareholders cannot be other corporations or partnerships. Businesses can also be structured as Limited Liability Companies (LLC) which allows for multiple owners, or "members", to benefit from limited liability. The profits or losses of the business organization pass directly through to the members' individual income tax returns.

When businesses conduct activity in more than one state, there are different ways in which each state determines the share of income of the business which is subject to state taxation. In Iowa, a single sales factor is used for apportioning income of C corporations. Single sales factor apportionment determines a business's tax liability based solely on sales within the state as a share of total sales. Other states use three factor apportionment which includes not only sales within the state, but also payroll paid to employees in the

state and the value of property located in the taxing state. With three factor apportionment, the three factors — property, payroll, and sales — are computed as ratios of the taxpayer's presence in the state over the taxpayer's presence everywhere. If a state uses multiple factor apportionment the state dictates whether the factors are considered equally or if they weigh the factors differently. It is up to each state how they determine the apportionment for taxing businesses and whether that apportionment applies to all forms of businesses.

While C corporations are allowed to apportion income before taxation in Iowa, shareholders are required to include all income from the S corporation in calculating taxable income under the individual income tax, even if some of that income results from sales outside of Iowa. The S Corp Tax Credit attempts to equalize apportionment treatment of income between C corporations and S corporations. The S Corp Tax Credit is structured so that the owners of the S corporation may pay tax only on the income attributable to Iowa under the single sales factor.

lowa shareholders also have the option to claim the Out-of-State Tax Credit on the IA 1040 if the income passed-through from the S corporation is subject to tax by another state. However, taxpayers cannot claim both the S Corp Tax Credit and the Out-of-State Tax Credit. It may be more beneficial for the taxpayer to claim the S Corp Tax Credit instead of the Out-of-State Tax Credit when either sales occur in states without an income tax or when sales occur in states with a lower income tax burden than lowa. A shareholder who has elected to apportion income by claiming the S Corp Tax Credit and then elects not to apportion income in a tax year, but claims the Out-of-State Tax Credit instead, cannot re-elect to again claim the S Corp Tax Credit for three tax years immediately following the first tax year in which the shareholder elected not to apportion income, unless the Director of the Iowa Department of Revenue consents to the election.

Although similar to S corporations, other pass-through entities must pass-through income to owners attributed to sales outside of Iowa. However, this tax credit does not apply to owners of any other type of pass-through entity. Note that these owners can claim an Out-of-State Tax Credit if the pass-through income was subject to tax by another state.

A taxpayer who is an lowa resident and a shareholder of an S Corporation that conducts business both in lowa and outside of the state can claim the S Corp Tax Credit by completing the IA 134 and the IA 148 Tax Credits Schedule. However, the tax credit can only be claimed up to the taxpayer's tax liability as it is nonrefundable with no carry forward. Any tax credit in excess of lowa tax liability expires and cannot be used. The tax credit cannot be transferred to another taxpayer. At its inception, the tax credit could only be claimed against individual income tax given that shareholders can only be individuals. Effective beginning in tax year 2013, the S Corp Tax Credit can be claimed on a fiduciary return filed by estates and trusts as recognition that ownership shares can be passed into a trust.

III. S Corporation Tax Treatment in Other States

S corporations receive pass-through tax treatment at the federal level, meaning that income is taxed at the shareholder level. Most, but not all, states follow federal treatment for S corporations. Some states (and the District of Columbia), tax S corporations at the entity level, the same as other corporations. These include: District of Columbia, Louisiana, New Hampshire, Ohio, Tennessee, and Texas.¹ Some states, like New Jersey and Rhode Island, allow the individual owners of the pass-through entity an income tax credit for their share of the pass-through entity tax paid by the entity.²

Among lowa's neighboring states, none offers a tax credit similar to lowa's S Corp Tax Credit (<u>Table 1</u>). Most of lowa's neighboring states also apportion C corporation income using a single sales factor.³ With the exception of Wisconsin, all of lowa's neighboring states apportion pass-through entity income in the same manner as C corporations. In Wisconsin, taxpayers file an Out-of-State Tax Credit for income attributed to another state. In addition, S corporations in Wisconsin may now elect to be taxed at the entity level or at the pass-through level.⁴

Also of interest is whether S corporations are treated the same as other types of passthrough entities, such as limited liability companies and partnerships. In all neighboring states, except Missouri, the apportionment of income is treated the same for all passthrough entities. Missouri is similar to lowa in that apportionment is only applicable to S corporations. It should be noted that when considering lowa's neighboring states, South Dakota does not have an individual income tax. In other states, most treat limited liability companies (LLCs) and limited liability partnerships (LLPs) the same as other passthrough entities.

IV. Analysis of S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims

While the S Corp Tax Credit has been available to be claimed since the 1996 tax year, information about those claims has only been available since the 2006 tax year when the IA 148 Tax Credit Schedule was implemented. Since 2006, there have been over 36,000 claims totaling over \$645 million (see <u>Table 2</u>). On average, 2,600 taxpayers claim the S Corp Tax Credit each year with an average claim of \$17,655. Annual claims total \$46.0 million each tax year, with total claims reaching a high of \$66 million and the average claim reaching more than \$23,000 in 2018.

¹ Article on pass-through entities state tax treatment in CCH group.com website.

http://news.cchgroup.com/2019/01/24/state-entity-level-tax-on-pass-through-entities/news/state-tax-headlines/ ² Article on pass-through entities state tax compliance in Bradley.com website. <u>https://www.bradley.com/-</u>

[/]media/files/insights/publications/2017/07/passthroughentitiesfacemyriadstateleveltaxescomplianceobligati.pdf ³ Sources: Revenue agencies in respective states

⁴ Article on Wisconsin treatment of pass-through entities in BDO.com website.

https://www.bdo.com/insights/tax/state-and-local-tax/wisconsin-enacts-election-permitting-pass-through#

For tax years 2012-2019, each year on average, there were 33,000 corporations filing 1120S – Schedule K1 tax returns with pass-through income for almost 53,000 shareholders (see <u>Table 3</u>). Meanwhile, an average of 2,700 shareholders filed S Corp Apportionment Tax Credit claims per year for that same period. Thus, between 4 and 7 percent of S Corp shareholders claim an S Corp Apportionment Tax Credit each year. The low utilization could reflect that many S corporations have 100 percent of sales in lowa, that shareholders choose to use the Out-of-State Tax Credit, or shareholders are nonresidents and are thus not eligible to claim the S Corp Tax Credit. Keep in mind that it is likely that many shareholders making claims to the S Corp Tax Credit could be shareholders of the same S corporation, thus the number of S corporations in a tax year.

Also of interest is how households that claim the S Corp Tax Credit compare to all other households. Households that claimed the S Corp Tax Credit in a tax year generally had a much higher adjusted gross income (AGI) than households that did not file S Corp Tax Credit claims over tax years 2006 through 2018 (see <u>Figure 1</u>). For households without an S Corp Tax Credit claim, nearly 83 percent of households had an AGI of less than \$100,000, measured in 2019 dollars. That compares to 10 percent of households that filed S Corp Tax Credit claims in that income group.

On average, there were over 25,000 lowa households that reported income from a passthrough entity on the Schedule E. That compares to fewer than 2,300 households that claimed an S Corp Tax Credit who also reported pass-through income on their Schedule E. An analysis was completed that compared the AGI of these two groups of households (see Figure 2). When looking at households with Schedule E pass-through income, the distribution is much more even across income brackets than in Figure 1 when all Iowa taxpayers were included. However, the skewness of income for taxpayers with S Corp Tax Credit claims compared to non-claimants is still quite pronounced. While 27 percent of households with Schedule E pass-through income reported AGI above \$100,000, 92 percent of households that filed S Corp Tax Credit claims reported AGI above \$100,000 over tax years 2013-2019. The \$66 million in S Corp Tax Credit claims in tax year 2018 translates into at least \$735 million in non-lowa source S corporation pass-through income that these taxpayers included on their tax returns, and thus included in AGI, but was effectively excluded from tax as a result of the tax credit claims.

V. Conclusion

The S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit is an administrative tax credit that provides S corporation owners and shareholders the option to apportion income in the same manner as C corporations.

Although an average of over 2,600 taxpayers in Iowa claim the S Corp Tax Credit each tax year, this is only a small fraction of shareholders in Iowa S corporations. The claims reduce individual income tax revenues by an average of \$46.7 million each tax year.

Iowa's S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credits

Tax Credits Program Evaluation Study

Tables and Figures

Table 1. How Corporation Income Is Taxed in Neighboring States

	How C Corporations	How Pass-Through	Are All Pass-Through	•		
State	Apportion Income	Entities Apportion	Entities Treated	Apportionment		
		Income	Equally?	Tax Credit		
Illinois	Single Sales Factor ¹	Single Sales Factor ¹	Yes	No		
lowa	Single Sales Factor	All income is subject to				
		tax but owners can file	No, only available for	Yes		
		Out-Of-State or S Corp	S-Corporations			
		Tax Credit				
Minnesota	Single Sales Factor ²	Single Sales Factor ²	Yes	No		
Missouri	Eight different methods	Eight different methods	No, only available for	No		
	are available	are available	vailable S-Corporations			
Nebraska	Single Sales Factor	Single Sales Factor	Yes	No		
South Dakota	No Income Tax					
Wisconsin	Single Sales Factor ³	All income is subject to				
		tax but owners can file	Yes	No		
	-	Out-Of-State Tax Credit				

¹ In Illinois: Except insurance companies, general businesses, financial organizations, federally regulated exchanges, and transportation companies which have special single-factor apportionment formulas.

² In Minnesota: If use of the default apportionment system does not fairly determine income, a taxpayer may petition for, or the Commissioner may require, the use of an alternative method.

³ In Wisconsin: Some industries have industry-specific methods for apportionment. Effective 2019, S-Corporations may elect to be taxed at the entity level and apply tax credit at that level. The tax credit may not be claimed at the individual shareholder level.

Sources: Revenue agencies in respective states

	Total S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit					
Tax Year	Number of Claims	Tax Credit Available	Tax Credit Claimed	Average Tax Credit Claim	Percent of Available Tax Credits Claimed	
2006	2,267	\$49,203,955	\$49,060,056	\$21,641	99.71%	
2007	2,427	\$39,414,943	\$39,103,763	\$16,112	99.21%	
2008	2,515	\$40,981,843	\$40,561,084	\$16,128	98.97%	
2009	2,285	\$33,169,764	\$32,170,945	\$14,079	96.99%	
2010	2,578	\$40,391,846	\$39,965,405	\$15,502	98.94%	
2011	2,635	\$46,681,708	\$46,540,598	\$17,662	99.70%	
2012	2,682	\$61,583,837	\$61,362,782	\$22,879	99.64%	
2013	2,622	\$36,140,604	\$35,451,327	\$13,521	98.09%	
2014	2,670	\$60,258,816	\$59,944,012	\$22,451	99.48%	
2015	2,809	\$46,902,059	\$46,700,629	\$16,625	99.57%	
2016	2,904	\$46,562,342	\$45,805,133	\$15,773	98.37%	
2017	2,976	\$45,028,382	\$44,153,214	\$14,836	98.06%	
2018	2,820	\$66,907,552	\$65,698,218	\$23,297	98.19%	
2019*	2,325	\$39,350,462	\$38,152,467	\$16,410	96.96%	
Total	36,515	\$652,578,113	\$644,669,633			
Average	2,608	\$46,612,722	\$46,047,831	\$17,655	98.79%	

Table 2. S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims,Tax Years 2006 – 2019

*Tax year incomplete Source: Iowa Department of Revenue

Table 3. Corporations Filing 1120S SchK1 Returns and Number ofShareholders Claiming S Corp Apportionment Tax Credit

Claim Year	Number of Corp. filing IA1120S SchK1	Number of Shareholders *	Tax Apportionment Credit Claims	Pct of Total Shareholders
2012	23,052	38,915	2,682	6.9%
2013	28,974	47,818	2,622	5.5%
2014	30,981	50,747	2,670	5.3%
2015	32,748	52,453	2,809	5.4%
2016	35,016	55,510	2,904	5.2%
2017	36,913	57,836	2,976	5.1%
2018	38,586	59,582	2,820	4.7%
2019**	37,984	58,276	2,325	4.0%
Total	264,254	421,137	21,808	
Average	33,032	52,642	2,726	5.2%

*Resident shareholders only

**Tax year incomplete

•

Source: Iowa Department of Revenue, FormIA1120S SchK1



Figure 1. Adjusted Gross Income of All Households Compared to Households With S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims, Tax Years 2006 - 2018

Source: Iowa Department of Revenue

Figure 2. Adjusted Gross Household Income of All Households with Schedule E Pass-Through Income Compared to Households With Schedule E Pass-Through Income and S Corporation Apportionment Tax Credit Claims, Tax Years 2013-2019



Source: Iowa Department of Revenue